



Minutes

NASHVILLE METROPOLITAN TRANSIT AUTHORITY

BOARD OF DIRECTORS MEETING

January 28, 2016

- I. CALL TO ORDER:** The regular meeting of the Nashville Metropolitan Transit Authority Board of Directors was held in the Music City Central Meeting Room, 400 Charlotte Avenue, Nashville, TN on January 28, 2016. Present were: Lewis Lavine, Vice Chair; Janet Miller, Member; Gail Carr Williams, Member; Walter Searcy, Member; Secretary Margaret Behm, and CEO Stephen G. Bland. A quorum was established and Vice Chair Lavine called the meeting to order at 1:30 p.m.
- II. APPROVAL OF MINUTES:** Proper motion was made to approve the minutes of the December 17, 2015 Board of Directors meeting. There were no additions or corrections, and the vote of approval was unanimous.
- III. PUBLIC COMMENTS:** Vice Chair Lavine reminded us that the Board welcomes public input and asks that comments be kept to three minutes. He then recognized the following members of the public:

James Thomas of Nashville had these comments:

1. On Christmas Day, the 5:28 a.m. bus on the Wallace Loop of the #12 Nolensville Pike was late leaving Walmart and came by his stop on the Wallace Loop really early.
2. On the 20th of the month, the 7:09 a.m. bus on the Wallace Loop of the #12 Nolensville Pike was extremely late to his stop on Wallace Road, so much so, he had to walk to Walmart to catch another bus.

Steve Rider of Nashville had these comments:

1. Mr. Rider suggests having outdoor meetings on the plaza next to Music City Central to gather input from people who might be reluctant to come to one of the other meetings.
2. Mr. Rider suggests that if we improve service in the areas where there are more choice riders, that ridership will increase.
3. Mr. Rider suggests that perhaps the reason transit ridership is decreasing in other cities is because the transit dependent riders are getting frustrated with the service, especially during rush hour when conditions are overcrowded and there are service disruptions.

Peter O'Connor of Nashville had these comments:

1. Following the recent snow storm, when service was being partially restored, the #12 Nolensville Pike bus only went to Walmart and back, without any of the extensions. Mr. O'Connor contends that the roads were clear in that area and the bus could have run its full route.
2. Mr. O'Connor complained about the way in which some drivers use the gas pedal that causes motion sickness for the passengers.
3. Mr. O'Connor also noted that he is seeing several improvements with the #12 Nolensville Pike route.

John Bull of Nashville had these comments:

1. Mr. Bull is pleased with the Automated Vehicle Locator (AVL) app and finds it is working well. He would love to see the AVL software be able to work with the talk and text apps.
2. Mr. Bull is delighted with the joint bus procurement that is being brought to the Board today that will allow bus replacements in a timely manner.
3. Mr. Bull is pleased with the scenario options that are being presented.

There were no other public comments at this time.

- IV. FINANCE COMMITTEE:** Chair Gail Carr Williams reported that the monthly financials were in order and that we will see some decline in revenue as it relates to decline in ridership. Also noted, we had some additional expenses in legal fees and in resolving a lawsuit. The Committee received a reforecast budget for consideration which looks good. Chief Financial Officer Ed Oliphant will keep us up to date on that and will reforecast, as necessary, to make certain we come out of the year with a balanced budget.

Continuing, Chair Williams reported that the Committee also had long discussions about the operating and capital budget. Both of those budgets included the assumption of some ridership increase, a full year of service for the Nolensville BRT-lite, the addition of a Thompson Lane feeder service in 2016, and additional service that we will discuss later in an action item. The committee also discussed the possibilities of either a partnership or collaboration with ride-share programs to see if that might be a fit.

The Committee also discussed items to be considered as we draft our capital budget. Some of those included were the replacement of equipment, including fareboxes; and our aging fleet.

Chair Williams then presented the following action item:

a. JOINT BUS PROCUREMENT (A-16-001):

On January 26, 2015, Nashville MTA issued a Joint Request for Proposal (RFP) with Knoxville Area Transit, Jackson Transit Authority, Memphis Area Transit Authority, and Clarksville Transit System ("Joint Partners") also participating. The request was to enter into contract to manufacture up to 186 buses (120 buses attributable to Nashville MTA). The Joint RFP allowed for any combination of

40-foot, 35-foot, and 30-foot low-floor diesel or diesel hybrid buses and 40-foot suburban diesel or diesel hybrid buses to be purchased over a five-year period.

The RFP received three (3) proposals from the following vendors:

1. El Dorado National
2. Gillig, LLC
3. New Flyer Industries

The evaluation committee panel consisted of project owners, technical experts and stakeholders from Nashville MTA and the Joint Partners. The committee ranked the original proposals according to the following criteria:

- | | |
|---|-----------|
| 1. Category Cost Sheet | 35 points |
| 2. Option Cost Sheet | 10 points |
| 3. Expertise, Technical Support, Product performance & RFP Response | 55 points |

Based upon the evaluation committee's scoring, Gillig, LLC offered the best value and lowest competitive cost. The pricing for the contract will include the base price per bus type in the initial year of the contract with an annual escalator being added to the base price annually using the Producer Price Index (PPI). This seasonally adjusted index measures the average change over time in the selling prices received by domestic producers of goods and services.

The consensus of the evaluation committee agreed that Gillig, LLC presented the best price and most responsive and responsible RFP submittal. The Finance Committee recommends to the Board approval to execute a three-year contract with an additional two one-year options, for the purchase of up to 120 buses with Gillig over the next five years. The committee is also requesting the Board to approve an initial purchase under the new contract for four 40-foot hybrid replacement buses for a total maximum cost of \$2,915,464 (\$728,866 per bus). The cost per bus includes all ancillary equipment such as a fare box, AVL equipment, and cameras. The funding source will be FY 2014 Metro Capital funding and federal Congestion Mitigation and Air Quality (CMAQ) grant funding.

There was no discussion and the vote of approval was unanimous.

- V. **PLANNING AND MARKETING COMMITTEE REPORT:** Chair Lewis Lavine reported that the Committee met for an elongated period of time last week. There were two items of focus; the first that he will report does not require action.

The Committee looked at the completion of the last phase, and the startup of the next phase of our strategic planning effort. They took a number of recommendations and put them into three scenarios at a very high level, a medium level, and a lower level of funding. They are very comprehensive and were presented well. None of the three scenarios will be what ends up being the final plan. Each of them represent a way to look at different issues, different routes, and different kinds of transportation, and that is what we will be doing over the next three months.

We are looking for continued public input, and we will be asking for that in a variety of ways. It will be up to this Board, come very late spring or early summer to convert this phase into a plan. It will probably come out in draft form and then final form and then be approved, hopefully, by this Board. There are continuing discussions with the State Department of Transportation, with the Mayor's office, with legislators, and with others in positions of authority, so that Nashville MTA does not end up with a plan, even though it is with RTA, which is ours and nobody else's.

Chair Lavine then presented the following action item:

- a. **PROPOSED SPRING 2016 SERVICE IMPROVEMENTS (A-16-002)**: Chair Lavine reported that every six months we look at service improvements. These have been vetted. We have gone out to public hearings and we looked at how these changes affect minorities and other groups. The improvements will cost an extra million dollars and a lot of that is because of the Nolensville BRT-lite. There are other routes that are being shortened or changed, and we have some public comment about that. There is some desire that some of these not be shortened, particularly the Chestnut Route, but because of ridership numbers and the cost of the service, the Committee felt that we needed to go ahead and make these changes. We will continue to look at that route particularly (Chestnut Route) to see if we need to change it in some other way to be accommodating. Proper motion was made, and the vote of approval was unanimous.

VI. CHAIR'S REPORT: Vice Chair Lavine took this opportunity to thank the team for all their efforts on the snow days. He thanked the team for making the right decisions. Member Gail Carr Williams echoed those sentiments. She noted that the storm came fast and quick and earlier than had been forecast. It happened at a critical time of the day when people are traveling. She noted that our operators did great jobs keeping our citizens safe, and staff did a great job keeping everyone informed.

VII. CEO'S REPORT: CEO Steve Bland reported the following:

- About the snowstorm:
 - Mr. Bland thanked the operators and maintenance employees who really worked hard through the snow to keep it clear and to keep it running and thus allowing us to do as best as we can.
 - There were several minor accidents and a couple of employee injuries with slips and falls. These storms are always learning experiences. I think there are a lot of things we can do better.
 - Our real time information, which is in beta testing, shows us we will want to make it an easier-to-use tool.
 - Our Customer Care unit, on a typical weekday handles 975 calls. On our peak day during the snow storm, they received 3400 calls and were able to handle 96% of them. That was really huge and an exceptional effort.
- We have continued to meet with our partners in our transit delivery and development process – everybody from the Mayor's Office, Public Works, MPO, a lot of our other regional partners, and particularly TDOT. All agree

that we have to do something different and the quicker we get there, the better off we will be.

- Earlier this month he was invited by Mayor Barry to participate with her in a meeting in Washington, DC with the Federal Transit Administration to lay out her vision for Nashville as a whole, but particularly with respect to mobility and transit. He noted that the Mayor did an outstanding job of communicating that vision and the partnerships that are going on in the community, and in keeping Nashville very high on the radar screen at the United States Department of Transportation for future initiatives and projects.
- A number of our staff this month participated in a workshop conducted by American Bus Bench Marking Group, a coalition of approximately 20 bus agencies about our size with some smaller and larger, the largest being Cleveland. Our participation is to both bench mark and to compare best practices to see in the operating realm how we can improve in performance.
- There are a couple of bills of interest with respect to transit in the legislature.
 - Senator Yarbrow has sponsored a bill that will permit bus on shoulder.
 - Representative Clemmons has introduced a bill that would enable some local option funding alternatives for transit that will lead to some interesting discussion.
 - Senators Ketron and Yarbrow have introduced legislation on public-private partnerships that could be helpful in expediting project delivery.
- We have completed preliminary interviews for Mark Sturdivant's replacement as Chief Development Officer, and we expect to have a number of people in Nashville in the next few weeks to do final interviews.

In conclusion, Mr. Bland noted the following pieces of RTA information for the Board's information:

- He and Felix Castrodad, Director of Planning and Grants, met with the consultants yesterday (January 27) on the Northwest Corridor study, which is the Clarksville to Nashville corridor. That project is moving very well. They will come to a point in that process that matches very well to the nMotion process; and, we can begin looking at next level scenarios in that corridor and how it blends into that overall regional plan. Felix has done a good job to make sure the nMotion staff from Nelson Nygaard has been in close touch with the Parsons Brinkerhoff staff on the Northwest Corridor to ensure that work is reflected in both the regional plan as well as those regional cost projections.
- We continue to work with the City of Mt. Juliet on joint development around the Music City Star station there. The RTA Board selected a joint venture led by Centric Architecture to look at transit oriented development at that station. That, in addition to the transit oriented development generating ridership, would actually generate revenue for the RTA.

This concluded his report.

Acting Chair Lavine asked Mr. Bland to speak to the methodology of how Nashville MTA arrives at our snow routes and service suspension during snow and ice storms.

Mr. Bland stated that Nashville MTA has published snow route detours that go into effect that can be looked up at any time on the web. However, snow and ice can develop quickly and create issues that cannot be predicted in certain areas and in advance, thus creating the necessity to close down more routes. He noted that during the heart of the most recent storm, only five core routes operated, but those five routes carry over 40% of our ridership. Concluding he stated that we try to give as much notice as we can when we have to suspend service, but safety is always our highest priority.

VIII. Other Business: There was no other business to come before the Board.

IX. Adjournment: The meeting was adjourned at 2:07 p.m.