

****Transcript used in place of meeting minutes****



8367 Greenvale Drive, Nashville, TN 37221
615-646-1386 / 1-888-377-0085

**WeGo Access Policy Advisory Committee Meeting
September 25, 2019
Nashville, TN**

This text is being provided in a rough draft format. CART captioning, Communication Access Realtime Translation captioning, is provided in order to facilitate communication accessibility and may not be a totally verbatim record of the proceedings. Any video that has been reproduced in text format is to comply with the Americans with Disabilities Act under the Fair Use Doctrine. This file is not to be distributed or used in any way that may violate copyright law.

>>JAMES BROWN: It seems like most everybody that is here that is going to be here is here so let's start with short introductions. My name is James Brown. I am the chair of

Tennessee Captioning
8367 Greenvale Drive, Nashville, TN 37221
tennesseecaptioning.com

ROUGH DRAFT

the committee. I am also the official representative of the Mayor's Advisory Committee and we'll just move on to my left which is April.

>>APRIL MEREDITH: My name is April Meredith and I'm here representing myself as a customer as well as Empower Tennessee.

>>JOHN FORBES: I'm John Forbes. I'm president of the Tennessee Organization of the Deaf Blind.

>>GEROME BOWEN: Gerome Bowen, nomination chairman.

>>TOM HINKSON: Tom Hinkson, Middle Tennessee Council of the Blind.

>>BILL ZAGORSKI: Bill Zagorski.

>>DAN FREUDBERG: Dan Freudberg.

>>NATASHA WILKINS: Natasha Wilkins.

>>TANESHA SIMMONS: Tanesha Simmons, and I'm the APAC liaison.

>>LORRI MABRY: Lorri Mabry consumer and ARC employee.

>>JAMES BROWN: So we do have a quorum. So we can go ahead and conduct official business I want to start by giving an introduction. This is the AccessRide Policy Advisory Committee for September and one thing we want to promote at this meeting is making sure that excellence happens within our transit system in Davidson County. That is our goal in this meeting and additional meetings. We want to first approve our minutes from July. Is there a motion or does anyone have any comments about the minutes?

>> TANESHA SIMMONS: There are some things I did that I didn't do correctly so I do need to make some edits to the minutes as soon as possible.

>>JAMES BROWN: So in this case would someone like to table the minutes to the next meeting?

>> I propose tabling the minutes.

>>LORRI MABRY: Second.

>>JAMES BROWN: A second by Lorri. All in favor of tabling to the next meeting in November, say aye.

[Ayes respond.]

Any opposed say no?

Tennessee Captioning
8367 Greenvale Drive, Nashville, TN 37221
tennesseecaptioning.com

ROUGH DRAFT

>>GEROME BOWEN: Gerome says no.

>>JAMES BRON: Motion carries. So I also want to remind everyone that we are recording these minutes. Karyn who did a wonderful job last time with -- man, it was great. Every word was perfect. So we want to thank her first of all, but also when you seek the floor it's very important that you mention your name. That way Karyn, who is getting to know everyone and also myself who doesn't quite know everyone's voice perfectly all the time, so we'll both know who you are. Is that good?

>>APRIL MEREDITH: Yes.

>>JAMES BROWN: Perfect. So we're going to move on. We've approved the minutes and move on to the public comment section.

>>TANESHA SIMMONS: We tabled the minutes.

>>JAMES BROWN: Yeah, I'm sorry. We did. We tabled the minutes. I'm not used to tabling minutes.

>>TANESHA SIMMONS: I know.

>>JAMES BROWN: Are there any public comments. Let me start out by saying there are three minutes per public comment and we can't usually address most issues that are brought up. What we can do is say we're going to look at those issues throughout the next couple of months and make sure we address those issues very promptly. Because there's been situations here where we've had 10, 15 people who wanted to make public comments. If you had that, you know, 10 by three minutes, you're talking about 30 minutes and then you start addressing those comments. So we don't always have time to address all those comments. So please understand if we're not able to do that. Who is up first?

>>TANESHA SIMMONS: We have Carol Francisco.

>> All right. Where would you like me to go.

>> Turn this way.

>> Come toward the front.

>> You're facing the fronts.

>>JAMES BROWN: If you place your hand on the Bible, please.

(Laughter)

Tennessee Captioning
8367 Greenvale Drive, Nashville, TN 37221
tennesseecaptioning.com

ROUGH DRAFT

>> Just want to make sure everyone can hear me. All right. I'm care Francisco, president of the Middle Tennessee Council of the Blind. Many of these complaints you've heard before, however, a couple months ago I ordered 20 tickets by mail. They were charged to my account. The envelope had my name on it. They had the address of another patron and went to her home. Thank goodness it was somebody I know and somebody who was honest and told me she received my tickets and sent them to me. This could have been a big problem if some stranger got them and went woo-hoo, free tickets. So y'all need to be careful who you are sending your tickets to. All right? We have the same recurring problem of the taxi drivers. Pull up to a driveway, don'ts call, don't ring the doorbell, don't blow a horn, pull off. You're a no-show. It's happened to me a few times. I do not know which companies. I suspect more than one are involved in this. All right?

I got a phone call Sunday morning, I don't know who this ride was for, I got a phone call at 8:00 in the morning saying I was a no-show. I didn't book anything for Sunday morning. Now, I don't know who missed their ride or should have been notified they were going to get a ride. It wasn't me. So those kind of things need to be taken care of so I don't get charged with a no-show and somebody else doesn't -- miss their ride unknowingly. So please take care of those kind of things. Okay? Saturday I was at a restaurant, I was supposed to be picked up 1:30 to 2:00. I wasn't. A friend drove me home and I got a phone call at 3:30 in the afternoon. Hey, we're here to pick you up. I don't think so. Not two hours late. I was home. So obviously there are a lot of issues to be dealt with. I'm sure other members of my organization who are here will be able to mention it to you other things. I have filed the complaint on the tickets. I never heard of anything from it. I do hope that you will pay careful attention to this. I don't want it to happen to anyone else. And to again deal with the cab drivers. They don't seem to understand that blind means I don't know you're sitting at the end of my driveway. Thank you.

>>JAMES BROWN: Thank you.

>>TANESHA SIMMONS: Thank you.

>>TANESHA SIMMONS: The next person is is that Janie Clark.

>> I'm Janie Clark and it's about two or three weeks ago I went to Kroger and the driver I had, she said she had been there ten minutes but she didn't call me until -- well until ten minutes later and she came in and got my groceries and then she told me that I had too many, that I was only allowed three bags. And I said I've never heard that. She said yes, you have. I says no, ma'am, I've heard ten. And so anyway, she took me on home and she said well -- well, when she was getting the groceries off, she said she was going to take a picture of it and she was going to call dispatch. I said I am too.

(Laughter)

Tennessee Captioning
8367 Greenvale Drive, Nashville, TN 37221
tennesseecaptioning.com

ROUGH DRAFT

I did. I did make a comment about it. And also, talking about the cabs, we went to eat, I arrived between 6:30 and 7:00 and they -- I called to find out about it and they told me a certain cab number 477 or something, I think it might have been Music City, but they never did come. Finally I called dispatch back. They said do you want that number? And I said yes. So I did and the one that answered then, she got us a cab pretty soon after then. And then we -- I didn't get home until about 9:00 and the others about four or five of us and the others probably didn't get home about 9:30 or something to 10:00. But that has been an issue. So thank you.

>>JAMES BROWN: Janie, have you reported those issues officially?

>> I reported the first one. I didn't the second.

>>JAMES BROWN: Will you do that for us?

>> Yes.

>>JAMES BROWN: And we'll make a note in the minutes and that's great because we can do that actually as I'm speaking that we will get back with Marilyn, have her check into your issues and contact you back. Is that okay?

>> That would be fine.

>>JAMES BROWN: Thank you.

>>NATASHA WILKINS: James, since that's a direct question, can we get clarity of what's the number of bags we are allowed?

>>TANESHA SIMMONS: It is ten or as many as you can carry. Ten is the number that's listed.

>>JAMES BROWN: Particularly to me, the driver not only giving you certain information that may or may not be correct, she also informed you that yes, you have heard that before and you cannot say that to a client because you have no idea what they have or have not heard before. So yeah, we take that pretty seriously.

>>DAN FREUDBERG: And James, I know Marilyn isn't here, but I'd be happy to speak to those who have specific complaints to dig into, particularly those you haven't submitted.

>>TANESHA SIMMONS: So the next one is Gary Chittester.

>> Gary.

>> I'm Gary Chittester, Middle Tennessee Council for the Blind. I'm going to speak on your serve. It's a improvement over Metro AccessRide. They have they are courtesy.

Tennessee Captioning
8367 Greenvale Drive, Nashville, TN 37221
tennesseecaptioning.com

ROUGH DRAFT

They either have not been trained on how to handle elderly people and blind people. Some of the cars have entranceways in the doorways that are too high for me to get into and the drivers don't have any stools or anyway to help you get in. Last week or so I tried to call UZURV and I was placed on hold for two separate times for ten minutes. The next day after that I was placed on a hold ten minutes. Hang up and leave your number and we'll call you back. Of course that never happened. The other day I signed up for a UZURV and they tell me it's \$7 to go down to my downtown location but it's \$8 to come back. I discussed it with Mr.-- with Tom and he gave me a pretty good answer, but it's insufficient for me and it's kind of Ludacris to charge so much money one way and so much money back. You go up so far, you come down to far and that's a good way to look at it. That's all I have to say except that you-serve has been an improvement over AccessRide. You could take all these buses and burn them as far as I'm concerned.

>>JAMES BROWN: For clarification, you had to step very high up onto a van, is that right?

>> I couldn't step up.

>> Yeah, I have the same problem.

>> That's the problem. Some of those cars are too high for us to get into without falling into them.

>>JAMES BROWN: So I'm assuming that might have been some of the wheelchair accessible vans?

>> No, no, no. It's a regular car from UZURV. Also I might say we don't get any feedback to any comments we make or complaints. Apparently there's no system for that don't know exactly what was done about a complaint. On behalf of maybe a Metro operator if they knew the complaints were going to be aired to the public.

>>JAMES BROWN: Dan, is part of the procedure to get back some kind of response to the complaint?

>>DAN FREUDBERG: Can you tell them.

>> All access rides are handled by the team, by Marilyn or (indiscernible) contacting back within a ten day window.

>> I assure you that doesn't happen.

>> I'm still waiting for mine.

>> Me too.

Tennessee Captioning
8367 Greenvale Drive, Nashville, TN 37221
tennesseecaptioning.com

ROUGH DRAFT

>> So I can get -- I can sit with the two of you afterwards to find out more information from your complaint. When you call customer care, we enter it into our system. Then it goes to the proper investigator, typically with AccessRide in terms of UZURV it would go to Marilyn or the Brittany and they will investigate.

>> That's all well and good except when I tried to make a complaint on two occasions I was put on hold. I couldn't get through.

>>JAMES BROWN: Who was speaking, was that --

>> Gary.

>>JAMES BROWN: No, what was your name.

>> Carol Francisco. I have had some of the trouble with the high vans. I have a bunch of metal in one leg and some cabs have high vans and no stool you can step into it and there are been two occasions I've had to say okay, if you can't help me get in or you can't let me sit in the front seat which is sometimes lower, and some tell me that it's against the rule, won't let me sit in the front seat, I believe it is but I've had drivers tell me they can't let anybody sit up front with them. So there have been a couple of times when I've had to just not go because I can't get into those very high vans.

>>APRIL MEREDITH: This is April. May I ask who spoke in regards to the follow-up?

>> Zeda, director of customer care. My team -- the customer care team would input the complaint in terms of AccessRide, especially with overflow providers. The AccessRide schedule team would be the group that would respond to you in terms of resolutions.

>> That's really great, if you can contact customer care.

>>ZEDA RIGGS: I mean, we can discuss what issues you have in terms of contacting us.

>>DAN FREUDBERG: Zeda and I will get together and check if there's a gap because it sounds like there's more than a couple. We'll figure out what's going on.

>>TANESHA SIMMONS: The next public comment is Roger Womack.

>> I think that was me. My name is Robert Womack.

>>TANESHA SIMMONS: It is Robert. Yeah.

>> All right.

>> Don't want to sound like I'm complaining. I just want to make this clear that there is a safety issue that I have. Got a 14-year-old Madison Sewell. She is in high school

Tennessee Captioning
8367 Greenvale Drive, Nashville, TN 37221
tennesseecaptioning.com

ROUGH DRAFT

and on several occasions but in the last three, three and a half weeks there's been actually two -- two occasions that she's been really scared. One occasion was the ride was actually an hour late and I kept calling, kept calling. And finally after the hour -- well, the first time I called, it was -- they were five minutes late. They said well, they're five minutes away from her. I was fine. Five minutes left -- went away, and I called back. And then they said well, we had to cancel that ride, after they were just five minutes from her, they had to cancel that ride. And we're looking for her another ride. Well, it took an hour for them to find another ride to go get her and that ride was coming from right here.

Second, week and a half ago she was an hour and a half at school late from being picked up. Everybody had left the school. There was nobody there. This is a young girl, it's fixing to start getting dark and hour and a half later I had to -- they said well, we're still looking for her a ride. After an hour and a half, you should have already figured this out, you know. Before an hour and a half after, you know, her pickup window. And I had to actually call Uber myself, have Uber come pick me up, go over there and get her and then carry us back home because Uber won't take a person that is under 18. So I had to call Uber. And I made complaints on both of these and I've made several other complaints. Yesterday they had a cab come pick her up for school. She was late for school because the cab driver said oh, I overlooked her. And so I -- I've made complaints on every one of these. I have yet to get one phone call because I -- they say do you want someone to call you back about your complaint? Yes, I do. Especially about those issues being a safety concern. And I have yet to get a phone call from anyone.

>>JAMES BROWN: Dan, I'll let you take that one.

>>DAN FREUDBERG: I'm taking down all these notes. I'm going to get with each of these customers afterwards.

>> I did have the complaint numbers, and I've got them at home. I forgot to bring them with me. I do have the one for yesterday but the other ones, I do have them at home but just didn't bring them with me today.

>>DAN FREUDBERG: That's okay. If we got your name and your daughter's name, we should be able to look them up.

>>JAMES BROWN: I'm very sorry for that. I know our committee isn't directly responsible but we'll try to do everything we can to make sure that doesn't happen again. Sounds scary. I've got two boys but if I had a girl, I would be very upset so I understand.

>>JOHN FORBES: John Forbes speaking.

>>JAMES BROWN: Yes.

Tennessee Captioning
8367 Greenvale Drive, Nashville, TN 37221
tennesseecaptioning.com

ROUGH DRAFT

>>JOHN FORBES: I would like to share with the committee that I had several pickups by Mobility Solutions. They were on time picking me up and on time delivering me to my designation. There was one with an excellent piece of equipment, the driver pulled out a ramp and I could walk into the vehicle with ease. It was very nice because sometimes it's difficult to get up into the seat on some of these vehicles. So I wanted to give them some pluses and pass that on to you. Thank you.

>>JAMES BROWN: Thank you, John. It's always good to hear good news about some of the good things that are going on.

>> I don't know if my name was put down on the list or not, Roger Womack. That's the reason I questioned when you called him.

>>JAMES BROWN: Is his name on the list?

>>TANESHA SIMMONS: It was Robert, I misread it.

>> I did have one comment.

>>JAMES BROWN: If you could spell your name.

>> Roger, R-O-G-E-R W-O-M-A-C-K. I know Robert has had several issues with Madison's rides. I've also had a question about a ride my daughter had. Over the last -- well, over the last seven rides we've had issues on six of them. I haven't filed but one complaint and that was a week and a half ago. My daughter's ride was at 5:40, the van showed up at 5:30. That's not a problem. Ten minutes early, we have no problem with going early. But she walks out there and they say, well, I've just been canceled from picking you up. Someone else is going to come pick you up. Okay. She's there and he's there. It doesn't make sense. Okay. I called the dispatcher and she said well, he was early. He's only ten minutes early. Well, someone else is on the way. So I wait until 6:10 and call back. Stay on hold five minutes and finally she comes and says it's going to be another 15 minutes. So it's after the time she's going to be late now. Finally, you know, she says well, he wasn't there. No, you told me he was there early, earlier. Well, he wasn't. He told me something different. Well, you told me something different. The dispatcher is the one that changed this. I don't know why a dispatcher would not let someone that's already at the site not take someone. Okay. And the other person they scheduled, scheduled for whoever else they've got to go for. That's a scheduling issue there. And when it finally showed up at 6, 30 she's out on the sidewalk ready to go but he lets the beeper on the bus go solid until she gets on and it wakes up the neighbors on a Saturday. No one wants to hear that that early in the morning and there's no excuse for it. I don't understand. And I haven't received any feedback on any complaints that I've filed. I guess that would be it.

Tennessee Captioning
8367 Greenvale Drive, Nashville, TN 37221
tennesseecaptioning.com

ROUGH DRAFT

>>JAMES BROWN: Thanks, Robert. The past couple of minutes we've had no public comments so this is a good refresher. I was --

>> There's one more.

>>TANESHA SIMMONS: James, there's one more. There's one more public comment.

>>JAMES BROWN: We've got one more.

>>TANESHA SIMMONS: Jason.

>> My name is Jason Emmons. I'm a board member of the Tennessee Organization of the Deaf Blind. Two occasions, back on August 27th I had a return ride between 12:30 (indiscernible)

and I was there the whole time. And so she booked me for, I think, 1:45 to 2:15 or 2:00 to 2:30, I can't remember which. She booked me for later. So I couldn't wait much longer since I have not had lunch and I'm a diabetic. So I called my mother and she came and got me. And so I called back and canceled that second time scheduled.

And a second occasion, I forget mid -- late July or early August, I can't remember which the second one was, I was going to meet my mother at a restaurant and I had a 4:30 to 5:00 pickup. The driver name came until 45 minutes after the 30-minute window, at 5:45. So I called several times before that. They said he's on his way. And I said can I call a cab driver and see where he is? We're not allowed to give out their number. Okay. And that's the two big issues I have.

>>JAMES BROWN: Jason, I know I feel your pain. On Saturday morning I was picked up about an hour late for a train for a marathon that I'm doing. So I only get to run twice a week and I was an hour late and I was picked up an hour late on the way back as well. And both of those cabs, Music City on the way there and On Demand on the way back, so definitely not perfect and I know, Dan, Tanesha, Marilyn, everybody is working to try and fill in these gaps to where this kind of stuff doesn't happen. It can't be perfect because we live in an imperfect world, but we can try to get it as close as we can. Anybody else want to speak up? Have any more public comments? All right. Hearing none we'll move on to the next item on the agenda. Gerome, you have the floor.

>>GEROME BOWEN: All right. Ms. Simmons, would you be so kind to read my report and give a copy to the chairman?

>>TANESHA SIMMONS: So okay. In light of recent events and inquiries we think it's important to provide a reminder of our responsibility as the nomination committee according to the presently official APAC bylaws. We will also report about our efforts to identify potential new members. Finally, we offer our nomination for membership. We

Tennessee Captioning
8367 Greenvale Drive, Nashville, TN 37221
tennesseecaptioning.com

ROUGH DRAFT

have earnestly worked to identify and obtain recommendations of individuals who we hope will bring value to the APAC committee.

First, under article II the chairperson shall appoint all subcommittee chairpersons including the nomination committee. The chairperson shall supervise, directly or indirectly, all committee work except, emphasis added, that were -- that of the nomination committee. Once appointed -- once appointment is made the nominating committee is charged with the functioning completely independently of the oversight of the APAC committee chairperson. As our illustrious leader notated in his message to me upon my appointment, the nominating committee is a little different as the bylaws state the nominating committee chair has the power to appoint its members as it makes APAC a built more democratic. Under Section 5 the appointment of re-elections of members will be presented by the nominating subcommittees and voted on at any regular meeting of the committee. This includes the summary of nominating committee responsibilities including the bylaws.

In accordance to the bylaws and my responsibilities, I appoint several members to the nominating committee including, Frank Meeuwis, Natasha Wilkins, Tanya Chavez and Patrick Neazer upon the resignation of Frank and Tanya from the APAC committee. Secondly, we have considered several exceptional professionals for membership nominations. We first began discussions with Dylan brown, the ark --
>>GEROME BOWEN: Dylan.

>>TANESHA SIMMONS: Dylan Brown, the Arc of Tennessee, People First Tennessee. The discussions occurred in May 2019 before we learned of Frank's resignation from the committee. We later learned the importance of quickly filling the membership seat for the Arc of Tennessee. We then talked about Mr. Ned Andrew Solomon, director of Partners in Policymaking as well as establishing advocate in the disability community across the State of Tennessee. We spoke directly with Erica Gilmore, Metro Council person at large who agreed to attend the meeting until a family emergency occurred. She agreed to attend future meetings. We contacted J.P. Williams as recommended by the APAC member. He will attend the next scheduled meeting as he is out of the country. We spoke to Mr. Charles Ray, veteran affairs. He plans to attend the next scheduled meeting. Alice Bowen, Tennessee Disability Coalition, director of benefits work was asked to attend the meeting today as representative of TDC. We have had members from TDC in the past and hope to encourage Ms. Bowen to consider participation. Finally, we spoke to Roger Womack, MTBC member who contacted me for APAC membership consideration. We spoke with others who declined an opportunity to participate on the APAC committee for various reasons.

Finally, Mr. Womack, who has already attended several APAC committee meetings is being nominated today to the APAC committee for a vote on his membership by the committee. Mr. Womack met with Patrick and I via a teleconference for an interview which was recorded as a public record of the process. Ms. Wilkins was unable to attend

Tennessee Captioning
8367 Greenvale Drive, Nashville, TN 37221
tennesseecaptioning.com

ROUGH DRAFT

the interview due to a conflict. However, she offered her opinion in favor of Mr. Womack via email message to me. We decided to honor the availability given to us by Mr. Womack and went forward with the interview. This concludes my report and the floor is now open to vote on the committee's nomination of Mr. Womack.

>>GEROME BOWEN: Thank you, Ms. Simmons. I offer to you all Mr. Womack. Do you have anything you want to say, Mr. Womack before we make a nomination?

>> Yes, sir. It -- I hope if I'm elected to the committee that I can help further the aid to WeGo and to the people of Davidson County. I will try to stay active and helpful. I guess that's about it, unless you have any other questions from me.

>>GEROME BOWEN: Open floor for Mr. Roger Womack. All aye, say aye?

>>APRIL MEREDITH: Can I have a question first?

>>GEROME BOWEN: What's your question?

>>APRIL MEREDITH: Before we vote? Sorry. I -- this is April. Of Empower Tennessee. I process better when I read things myself so I apologize if it's clear to everybody else. There was a lot of information there. So I'm just trying to clarify Roger, is it Roger or Robert?

>> Roger.

>> R-O-G-E-R.

>>TANESHA SIMMONS: There's a Roger and a Robert.

>>APRIL MEREDITH: There's two Womacks.

(Laughter)

So is Roger here to be voted in as the ark's representative?

>>GEROME BOWEN: No, no, no.

>>APRIL MEREDITH: That was confusing to me.

>>GEROME BOWEN: No, just community person.

>>APRIL MEREDITH: Just in general, like APAC in general or on the nomination --

>>GEROME BOWEN: APAC, APAC.

>>APRIL MEREDITH: Gotcha. Thank you.

Tennessee Captioning
8367 Greenvale Drive, Nashville, TN 37221
tennesseecaptioning.com

ROUGH DRAFT

>>GEROME BOWEN: Any more questions? Let's move for a vote. All for Mr. Womack say aye.

[Ayes respond.]

All against, say nay. All right, Mr. Womack, welcome to the committee.

(Applause).

>>JAMES BROWN: That was a great report and I think you got my words on point word for word in that. Pretty impressive.

>>GEROME BOWEN: Thank you. That's how it's going to be from now.

>>JAMES BROWN: The next item on the agenda is the -- what I call the DSOC, Digital Solutions Committee. So it's been kind of interesting for me as I've thought about this committee over the past month, month and a half. I've started riding the fixed route which is the bus a little bit. And so I kind of come up with some interesting solutions taking the 55 home all the way down close to the Bank of America and was able to do that for \$1 which was not bad. And catch an Uber home for \$5. A \$6 trip is actually cheaper than the On Demand service. So I've started thinking about transportation in a different way because one of the things we wanted to do is APAC, according to our bylaws, is look at all the different avenues of transportation inside Davidson County. Inside the county and see how we can make those avenues better. And if there are any interesting solutions. You know, now another thing I found out is that still the buses are not saying the GPS locations if you're going by a major stop. You're still having to depend on that bus driver to not forget where you're going and then also depend on, you know, the noise level being at a certain level to where you can actually hear the bus driver. So I'd love to see some stuff like that go on. I'm going to appoint the committee members, probably over the next week or two. My schedule is going to slow down in about a week and so I should be able -- in about a week, yeah. And so we should be able to meet before our next meeting. And when I say before our next meeting, I'm hoping we can meet directly before our next meeting and that way have a nice, fresh report -- committee report to give you all. Are there any questions about the committee.

>> This is Carol Francisco. I think my concern, I know you're blind also, is that again, as Nashville is a relatively inaccessible city with very few sidewalks and very few auto pedestrian traffic signals that I think we have to really be careful how we promote this thing due to these safety factors.

>>JAMES BROWN: Duly noted.

Tennessee Captioning
8367 Greenvale Drive, Nashville, TN 37221
tennesseecaptioning.com

ROUGH DRAFT

>> If we ask people to use these solutions using Uber and things like that, if you don't have a sidewalk to walk on or if you have to cross extremely busy street with no pedestrian signals, this really puts people in a safety concern position.

>>JAMES BROWN: Don't get me wrong, Carol. We're not asking people to use Uber. I'm just looking at transportation in a different way. So I'm putting on some different glasses, I guess you could say.

>> Okay. That was my concern.

>>SHEILA HANSEN: Sheila Hansen speaking. I am wondering if -- I don't know APAC would do this or just in general, have some kind of campaign or letter writing campaign or something to the city, TDOT, whoever does this, to try to get them to make more audible signals around town. I've been in other towns where, you know -- because I travel a fair amount. I've been Louisville, Kentucky, and Delray Beach, Florida, and different places they have -- they don't just have a little beeper to where the blind person has to guess okay, which way am I supposed to -- which way is this beeper signaling for me to cross. It will have -- they have spoken, you know, cross or wait and it does a spoken countdown as to how many seconds you have to cross. I've videotaped a couple of these with the idea of trying to approach Metro about this.

>>JAMES BROWN: Sheila, my favorite ones are in Washington, DC where they tell you what street you're crossing, they name the street.

>>SHEILA HANSEN: That would be even better.

>>JAMES BROWN: And they give you the countdown. Okay, you've got six, five, four, so you know if -- you know, because one of the big things when I come to a parallel crossing is how long has the parallel traffic been going.

>>SHEILA HANSEN: I never start crossing until the next one out.

>>JAMES BROWN: I have to really be careful until I step out because I'm a risk-taker. And so I've had to really beat myself up. Okay, I have to make sure that the light's not going to turn red on green in like two seconds.

>>SHEILA HANSEN: Having been hit by a car three times in my life, I don't do that.

>>JAMES BROWN: But the Mayor's Advisory Committee is working on that issue right now. It's probably not going to happen overnight because in order to replace some of these audible crosswalk signals they have to be older. They're going to replace them as they go bad, but we can push hard for that.

>>SHEILA HANSEN: Maybe we should push some over so they have to replace them. I'm bad.

Tennessee Captioning
8367 Greenvale Drive, Nashville, TN 37221
tennesseecaptioning.com

ROUGH DRAFT

>>JAMES BROWN: The thing they don't realize is they're actually a big liability, especially if they work one way and not the other and they're a really big liability. So we're going to work on it.

>>JOHN FORBES: John Forbes speaking. With the timers on the cross lights for streets, they need to be much bigger than they are. Like, for example, Nolensville pike where I live near the zoo, I cannot even read it on the other side. It is too small.

>>SHEILA HANSEN: Get you a monocular.

>>JOHN FORBES: That needs to be taken in.

>>JAMES BROWN: Me too, John, I can't read it either.

>> Roger Womack, also Charlotte Pike and White Bridge Road, there's crossings there but there's three instead of four.

>>SHEILA HANSEN: Oh, yeah.

>> And it's very -- there's no crosswalk but -- and the signals, a blind person has to go three different streets to get across safely when they could cross the one. So that's an issue maybe you could bring up to the mayor's advisory board. That's one intersection I know of for sure.

>>NATASHA WILKINS: James?

>>JAMES BROWN: Yes.

>>NATASHA WILKINS: In regard to some of these intersections, I can't remember exactly what the meeting was but I along with a couple -- a self evaluation audit meeting that they had.

>>JAMES BROWN: There's another one coming up.

>>NATASHA WILKINS: And it was recorded. Is it open to --

>>JAMES BROWN: Yeah.

>>NATASHA WILKINS: It's open to the public. It's not just the public that can come. I would strongly suggest we come. I got on the mic and shouted out specific intersections as well to let them know they're ill-timed, that you can cross one way with the signal but not the other, things you are saying. They are aware of it. We will probably have to push to make sure these things we brought up in the audit are taken seriously and move forward but Metro is in a self auditing mode but we should help push it forward.

Tennessee Captioning
8367 Greenvale Drive, Nashville, TN 37221
tennesseecaptioning.com

ROUGH DRAFT

>>JAMES BROWN: And we'll send out a notice on that self auditing meeting.

>>NATASHA WILKINS: Maybe more people will come out.

>>APRIL MEREDITH: This is April. I'm not saying anything for or against the potential proposed solutions of the type of signals needed at the crossings but I would like to just encourage that we do think as best as possible for universal accessibility. Not just from the -- a blind or low vision perspective but one -- I do know that there are -- and this is just in general, just I don't -- I can't cite a specific city, but there have been -- well, New York City has had some pushback about noise pollution complaints because of the talking going on constantly from some of the signals and then as far as the disability perspective sometimes it is related to sensory disabilities, so like I said, I'm not here to support or decline support for any particular method but just a point of consideration when addressing those sidewalk crossings.

>>GEROME BOWEN: Are we looking more toward making sure accessibility is made for people in wheelchairs and other disabilities as well as instead of us being blind because they have a lot of trouble crossing streets, wheelchairs.

>>JAMES BROWN: Oh, yes, curbs.

>> Curbs are not consistent in Nashville.

>>GEROME BOWEN: I know we're not saying anything about them. I just want to make sure we're not overlooking them.

>>JAMES BROWN: We have all representations on MAC so we're -- so Jerry Hall, who is our ADA guru, he's been doing this a long time. The only thing we have to do is push them to go a little faster. They're on the right track. And we have to let them know our preferences, too. Get those chirping birds out, you know, that kind of stuff. You guys know what I'm talking about. Stuff that was deemed obsolete 20 years ago.

>> Have you ever heard a bird imitate one of those things?

>>JAMES BROWN: Guys, we've got to move on to our next item because we don't want to be over our two-hour allotment. Dan, you are up to talk on the ride passes.

>>DAN FREUDBERG: Yes, and also talk about a few things you brought up with the accessibility of the fixed route service and the announcements not working. That's something that we've seen as an issue as well and our maintenance and IT folks are working to do audits to see which are not working. If you ride and see a bus that is not announcing the stops let us know so we can get the issue addressed. Also we'd love to talk about additional tools that are available to help to navigate the city and especially the fixed bus route in general, whether smartphone apps or things like that available with additional solutions committee if you'd like to have that conversation at some point.

Tennessee Captioning
8367 Greenvale Drive, Nashville, TN 37221
tennesseecaptioning.com

ROUGH DRAFT

>>JAMES BROWN: That would be perfect.

>>DAN FREUDBERG: So moving on to the Access pass update, so unfortunately I wasn't able to attend the last meeting but there was a discussion that a good discussion about different types of passes that are offered in other cities for paratransit and that how some cities offer discounts for purchasing passes in bulk or sort of have a monthly pass option that's available. And so our understanding, based off of the information that we received from that meeting, was that we were to take a look at what other cities offer in terms of those types of pass products, what kind of a pricing structures are, and how those -- you know, how that might work in those cities versus in Nashville and then also look at -- look at some of the cost information and kind of what the -- what the impacts would be. And then just present that information to the committee to have a discussion on.

So I believe it was distributed before this meeting via email, there was a discussion item about the -- the findings that we -- that we had, the results of the research that we did, and I was just going to review those briefly verbally and then let the committee discuss and of course we're also available to answer any questions that individuals might have regarding the options that we looked at.

So we looked to see, especially for the sort of unlimited monthly passes what other cities -- you know, are there other cities that offer these types of passes. We know of course one came up during the -- the meeting itself, but there are others. So we looked at a number of cities, 14 cities in total. And out of those we did identify four cities. I'm happy to let you know what all the 14 cities were and they were in the information as well. But the four cities we did identify that have some type of monthly pass product were Atlanta, Charlotte, Dayton, and Columbus from those that we looked at. And the -- those cities differed in terms of the price structure for those passes but generally speaking they had what we call a breakeven point or the point at which it would be cost effective for a customer to purchase that type of a product at between 30 and 40 rides for a month. So, for example, in -- in Charlotte where the cost of their paratransit fare for one ride is \$3.50 and the monthly pass is \$140, so 40 rides, you would take 40 rides and you would reach basically that breakeven point at which point it would make sense for a customer to purchase that pass. We also looked at other differences for those four city that is we did find that offer that type of a pass to just understand how their paratransit service operates and compare it on a couple of really basic levels. So, for example, for those that do offer that pass product, those four cities also do enforce the three quarter mile restriction around fixed route, which we serve the entire county with paratransit. And they also do the -- a mix of curb to curb and door-to-door. Two of them did curb-to-curb service and two did door-to-door service which is a reminder we do door-to-door where we assist customers to the entry point of their residence or business or wherever they're going to, to and from. So that's some basic information. The cost of the pass ranged from \$115 -- \$105 up to 140 a month. And the cost of the

Tennessee Captioning
8367 Greenvale Drive, Nashville, TN 37221
tennesseecaptioning.com

ROUGH DRAFT

single ride in those cities ranged from \$3.50 to \$4. So comparable to what we have here at \$3.70.

So we looked at what the potential revenue loss would be if we put a pass in like that. So we -- we also looked at what the breakeven points would be for different price structures. So, for example, if we had an unlimited pass that was offered for \$148 and we had a customer that rode 50 times for a month at \$3.70, right now they'd be paying \$185 because they're riding -- paying per ride. So that particular customer would save \$37 for the month, if we introduced a pass that was -- that was priced at that \$148 level. But of course that \$37 that the customer saves is \$37 that the agency wouldn't necessarily be collecting.

In addition, there is the possibility of customers riding more if there's a pass product available that allows them unlimited rides for a fixed -- for a fixed price. And that has potentially significant implications in terms of the cost to provide the service. The -- the more trips that are provided on paratransit, the more the cost is to the agency because there is generally speaking a cost per trip to transport the customer, whether we're transporting them on WeGo operated vans or on the taxi service providers. And the average cost per trip is about -- about \$35, sometimes a little bit higher, so you can see how if a customer goes from, say, taking 50 trips per month to 60 trips per month because this pass option is available, that cost can add up pretty quickly and that would be in that example an extra \$350 in cost. It's difficult actually to estimate how much more people would ride with that type of a product but just something to consider when thinking about that

>>JAMES BROWN: Probably could compare the On Demand numbers and how they went up?

>>DAN FREUDBERG: Yeah, gives us some idea but those are still on a per -- per trip. So we looked at -- to try to get an idea using those examples what the impact would be, we looked at how many customers we have that ride more than a certain amount per month. So we have ride now about 7,500 active riders, riders that have written in the last 12 months or so. In a given month we generally -- we provide service to about 2,000 customers. And out of those 2,000, about 300 take 30 or more trips per month and about 150 take 40 or more trips per month. So those frequent service customers are the ones that might, you know, potentially most benefit from this type of a product. And so we also looked at the --

>>JAMES BROWN: So those numbers, is the 20 carried inside the 30? I guess it's not, you said 200 and 150?

>>DAN FREUDBERG: Yeah, sorry, the 150 is included in there. So we have 300 passengers who take 30 trips a month and then 150 of those take 40, yeah. So we looked at a couple of different possible breakeven points for theoretical monthly pass. So if we priced the pass at a breakeven of 30 trips, if you took more than 30 trips you would save money that would be a cost per pass of \$111. For a ticket at \$40 -- sorry, a

Tennessee Captioning
8367 Greenvale Drive, Nashville, TN 37221
tennesseecaptioning.com

ROUGH DRAFT

breakeven point of 40 rides at \$3.70 per ticket, the monthly pass would be \$148. For the first example of the breakeven points of 30 trips, the revenue impact is between 90 and \$100,000 in terms of just the lost revenue on fares. If you price it a bit higher at 40 trips as the breakeven point, then that does go down to about 25,000 per year. But of course, the benefit is just to a certain few -- fewer customers that ride very frequently. Now, that doesn't necessarily include the induced demand. So again, we don't necessarily know how much more people will ride with a product like that being available, but just as an example, if -- if just overall trip demand increased by about 2%, then that would equate to approximately \$300,000 in additional expenses in terms of providing the additional service. Again, whether it's on our vehicles or on the third-party services.

>>GEROME BOWEN: Gerome. Go ahead, Natasha.

>>NATASHA WILKINS: I'm sorry, I have not said my name yet. Natasha Wilkins. I had a quick, probably the people taking 40-plus trips a month are probably working full time or, you know, have a regular volunteer gig, they're going somewhere twice a day. And so -- they're going somewhere twice a day at a minimum. And so probably the way they would initially think of it okay, great, my dialysis/work/gym throughout the week is covered and so their savings would probably be things they're doing on the weekend. I'm not saying that it won't jump by this huge number, but ideally they're probably going to be taking the same number of trips, maybe just a few more and their savings is going to be on like those supplemental things that they may do in the evening or the weekend that they might feel like there's a savings from. That was just my initial thought. Like I don't know that it will be a ton of people that's going to say oh, let's -- let's go, all day every day, you know. It's probably going to be those same people who are taking those 40 to 50 trips a month and they're just going to see that savings. So there's a possibility that it might not be this huge jump. And there's a possibility it might. Yeah.

>>DAN FREUDBERG: It is difficult. It's difficult to know. We can look at examples from other cities as well. But most of these cities that have these passes in place have had them in place for some time. So finding out what happens during that transition can be tricky. And of course it depends city to city as well. And even down to -- like you said the individual habits of those customers. If we're talking about maybe 300 people whose habits might change, you know, it really does come down to what those individual customer decision-making processes and priorities are.

>>JAMES BROWN: Yeah. I think On Demand, when you looked at those jumps, they were mainly because of the convenience of the service. And, you know, if I -- if I wake up tomorrow and decide I don't want to go to work and I'm just at home, with ondemand I can go you know, I think I might want to go get some pizza. There's a buffet down the street. I want to do that for lunch and I can set that up that day. The idea is you're able to have a lot more flexibility in your life and that makes the On Demand jump a lot higher.

Tennessee Captioning
8367 Greenvale Drive, Nashville, TN 37221
tennesseecaptioning.com

ROUGH DRAFT

I'm not sure that, you know, exactly if AccessRide trips that are regular would do that, I'm more on Natasha's side.

>>NATASHA WILKINS: I think that's apples and oranges. That's a good point.

>>JAMES BROWN: Gerome.

>>GEROME BOWEN: Dan, do you know how many people actually travel in the system a month. I know one time you talked about 30,000 people on AccessRide. Do you know what the numbers are now? How the rate increase affected people?

>>DAN FREUDBERG: Let's see how many trips we supplied. I've actually got that in operating statistics. For July 2019 we did about 27,000 trips, which -- and some of those have more than one customer on board if there's a PT or something like that, gives you an idea. And that's -- but of those we're talking about 2,000 unique customers that comprise that number of trips and an additional 4,000 on Access On Demand.

>>GEROME BOWEN: County by county would be a lot different, because we move county to county.

>>JAMES BROWN: He's saying we cover county to county.

>>DAN FREUDBERG: We do.

>>GEROME BOWEN: It would make a great difference if we start transporting people for this particular program.

>>DAN FREUDBERG: Sorry, I'm not quite following the question.

>>JAMES BROWN: We're a little more unique than those other people.

>>GEROME BOWEN: Out in the county rather than just the city.

>>JAMES BROWN: Is Cleveland on that list. I looked at it briefly and I don't think I saw it.

>>DAN FREUDBERG: It wasn't on the list but that was the -- the agency that I had mentioned came up during the -- I think during the meeting itself.

>>JAMES BROWN: I think Walter mentioned Cleveland. I called Cleveland, asked them if theirs was from county line to county line. They told me yes, that was the customer service agent. And of course they have a monthly pass there and it looked pretty reasonable. It sounds like -- you know, we talked about a few different things at our meeting and it sound like this might be hard to sell to the board. But what might not be as hard is just if you buy 30 tickets you get 20% off. That's what I saw in Phoenix.

Tennessee Captioning
8367 Greenvale Drive, Nashville, TN 37221
tennesseecaptioning.com

ROUGH DRAFT

>> Yes!

>>JAMES BROWN: That's what I saw at a lot of places. So we're not -- we're not trying to trip over all these details and well, we could be costing ourselves this money. When we were at the MTA board meeting there were several of us in attendance and at the subcommittee meeting when it was being determined if AccessRide would go from 3.40 to 3.70 or 3.40 to 4. One of the subcommittee members turned to Walter and said -- or somebody on the committee, basically if we keep this at 3.40 and don't move it up to 4, would it be a negligible cost and the person turned and said yes. So if you're moving, for those people who do purchase a lot of tickets, back, say, 20%, we're still looking at, you know, 10, 20 -- we're still looking at what could potentially be a negligible cost. So I think we need to be looking more in that direction because it's not, quote, catastrophic. And also one thing I wanted to bring up, Dan, and this is what -- this is the genesis of this whole conversation that you and I had talked about out in the hallway at the board meeting, you know, we originally brought this up for the low income customers. You know, for the people who basically make \$700 a month. And, you know, we brought it up at the last APAC and one of our members brought up some regulation, maybe a federal regulation he thought might block this only covering low income. I'm not sure that that's actually, you know, a fact or not, but do you know anything that might block something like that?

>>DAN FREUDBERG: I'm not aware of -- I'm not aware of any federal policy or law that would restrict the implementation of a low-income discount fare program. It's not required, but that's not to say that it's restricted. Tanesha, do you know of any?

>>TANESHA SIMMONS: I don't know of any.

>>NATASHA WILKINS: And even if there was legally, that can only be enforced if we're trying to enforce an income-based program, which we're not.

>>GEROME BOWEN: How would you determine if they were low income. What would be your basis for that.

>>NATASHA WILKINS: That's what I'm saying, it's not income based. It's going to be based on the number of tickets, it's not income based. Whether you make \$1,000 or 100,000, if I decide to buy 30 tickets and you go the route we just discussed get the ticket.

>>GEROME BOWEN: In the last it was stated it was income based.

>>NATASHA WILKINS: It's going to benefit --

>>JAMES BROWN: We're just exploring different options.

>>NATASHA WILKINS: Benefit those people more.

Tennessee Captioning
8367 Greenvale Drive, Nashville, TN 37221
tennesseecaptioning.com

ROUGH DRAFT

>>GEROME BOWEN: When we look at the minutes it was discussed low income and also discussed how could we figure out who was low income.

>>TANESHA SIMMONS: Yeah, we said we were going to get away from the income requirements.

>>GEROME BOWEN: Good.

>>TANESHA SIMMONS: And focus more so on discounts for everyone.

>>BILL ZAGORSKI: This is Bill Zagorski. To mitigate some of the financial impact, if any of this only applied to individual riders as opposed to excluding institutions, we pay for -- we have prepaid systems for our riders. Would it be more intelligent to exclude institutions from any type of discount because we're institutions that are buying in bulk and that's not a discount that needs to be applied to us.

>>JAMES BROWN: Like your organization might purchase \$7,000 worth of tickets each month.

>>TANESHA SIMMONS: That's a good point.

>>BILL ZAGORSKI: No need to include institutions in these discount programs because that's not who it is to benefit. It's to benefit individuals.

>>NATASHA WILKINS: That would be a blow to MTA to get such a discount. That's a good point.

>>BILL ZAGORSKI: Of those 300 or 14040 plus riders a day I know for a fact at least 15% of them come to our center.

>>JAMES BROWN: I know a lot of people take advantage of this because the passes don'ts really run out. So I mean, if you buy 40 passes and you only take 10, 15 trips, you know, a month, that's going to last you for three, four months.

>>NATASHA WILKINS: Until next month, yeah.

>>JAMES BROWN: People are going to take advantage -- water runs downhill.

>> Thanks for clarifying that. Because the impression I got was the pass only lasted a month which would mean that I wouldn't consider it because I'd probably have a lot of extra rides on the table.

>>JAMES BROWN: I think we're kind of excluded that portion because the financial impact might be so great and so, quote, scary when we took it to the MTA Board that the likelihood that they would reject it is very strong. So I think the -- the idea of buying a

Tennessee Captioning
8367 Greenvale Drive, Nashville, TN 37221
tennesseecaptioning.com

ROUGH DRAFT

package or a bundle of tickets that are discounted is a much more palpable situation. I think for everyone.

>>APRIL MEREDITH: This is April Meredith. I do currently buy in bulk and there's a maximum number that they'll allow.

>>JAMES BROWN: Is it per month or --

>>APRIL MEREDITH: Per transaction. Yeah. So it would benefit me.

>>NATASHA WILKINS: You personally or Empower?

>>APRIL MEREDITH: Yeah, my passes last three months due to the number. I get the maximum each time because I technically live out of county and use it when I work here. Because you pay for shipping and handling, right? So instead of buying, you know, 20 passes each month, I buy the maximum. I'm --

>>TANESHA SIMMONS: 100.

>>APRIL MEREDITH: Thank you. I buy the maximum number so --

>>JAMES BROWN: Those are only good for three months?

>>APRIL MEREDITH: No, there's no limit. It's just the regular passes. I know we're about to change the rate, but you -- the -- these will still -- my leftovers will still be honored while we transition to the new rate.

>> What is the maximum number, Roger Womack speaking?

>>TANESHA SIMMONS: 100.

>> Oh really?

>>APRIL MEREDITH: Yeah, so I don't buy every month. It's about every quarter currently. So I pay only the shipping and handling that one time.

>>DAN FREUDBERG: We can talk about how we can make the process a little easier with the new fare system which I think we'll be able to explore.

>>APRIL MEREDITH: The card system, things like that, yeah.

>>DAN FREUDBERG: And James, I don't want to necessarily, you know, scare the committee away from exploring options. This is just to let you know, these are just kind of the factors for consideration. But we would also be happy to look at what the -- what the potential impact of a -- like a bulk -- so, for example, 10% discount off of 10, something like that, is that what you're thinking?

Tennessee Captioning
8367 Greenvale Drive, Nashville, TN 37221
tennesseecaptioning.com

ROUGH DRAFT

>>JAMES BROWN: Yeah, Phoenix was pretty much 10% off of 10, 20% off of 20, 30% off of 30. They were going along --

>>NATASHA WILKINS: Graduated.

>>DAN FREUDBERG: 100% off of 100?

(Laughter)

>>APRIL MEREDITH: Hey, mine would be free.

>>JAMES BROWN: 100% off 100.

(Laughter)

>>DAN FREUDBERG: Pretty soon, we're paying you. But yeah, we can look at something like that. And see what the revenue impact might be. And there's -- of course there's the possibility of induced demand there as well but it's less pronounced because you're still paying per ride. It's not the unlimited.

>>JAMES BROWN: This ride is free. Once I get past 30, every ride after that is free. So start thinking of a way.

>> Well, I know an area I've been in Florida where I considered relocating, they actually -- it's a large county, probably the largest but it's spread out and they actually set this county into zones and so you have your ticket but then you have to pay an extra dollar if you cross zones and that can be really confusing and it can add up.

>>SHEILA HANSEN: When I first moved to Nashville on the fixed route buses they used to have a zone thing where if you went past the zone it went up 5 cents.

>> This is even on AccessRide.

>>SHEILA HANSEN: This was on the buses but I remember zone fares very well.

>>JAMES BROWN: Was that before the county got incorporated or something?

>>SHEILA HANSEN: It was in the '80s. I don't remember when they changed it.

>>APRIL MEREDITH: Yeah, I bet it was before.

>> I didn't move here until '90.

>>JAMES BROWN: Dan, would you be able to continue to explore that.

>>DAN FREUDBERG: Yeah, we'll look into that. Is there anything else that you would like staff to dig into regarding fare policy regarding that option?

Tennessee Captioning
8367 Greenvale Drive, Nashville, TN 37221
tennesseecaptioning.com

ROUGH DRAFT

>>NATASHA WILKINS: James, do you want to mention the -- the mailing thing now?

>>JAMES BROWN: You can mention that if you want to.

>>NATASHA WILKINS: Okay. Since he asked.

>>JAMES BROWN: Anything else? Well.

>>NATASHA WILKINS: Since you asked, we've talked about this a couple of times before and I know I've brought it up and James knows I'm pretty per sis at the present time. But another thing to look at is the \$3.50 shipping or the mailing fee. And I know that like April and myself who aren't down here enough to really come and when I do come down here to purchase it's a circus because they're so helpful. Wait, we've got somebody to open up the door and come around and things like that because the box is -- the credit card machine is in the little security box. So we lost that ability to like slide the card and things like that. Tanesha, I know you said you were going to look into it so before I say anything else --

>>TANESHA SIMMONS: I emailed you about it.

>>NATASHA WILKINS: So here's the thing and we need to talk about that later. You don't have my right email address so I keep missing your emails. I'll email you because I think you still have my Trevecca email. I'm not getting your emails even on MAC. I'll wait to hear from Tanesha. That's something that will be a big help to those of us who have to purchase over the phone or not physically able like myself to use the credit card slide machine that's over there in the little security slide box.

>>DAN FREUDBERG: Let me follow up internally on that because we had conversations in the past that recommendation along so let me see where that conversation is.

>>NATASHA WILKINS: Okay.

>>TANESHA SIMMONS: We'll discuss it.

>>NATASHA WILKINS: Perfect.

>>DAN FREUDBERG: Anything else for the fare?

>>NATASHA WILKINS: Maybe a good point, I know you want to look at it in levels of metrics. Maybe a point like you did some great research on the 30 and 40 number of tickets purchased in a month maybe in the discount we can look at what does it look at 30, what does it look like at 40 or like James was suggesting, the 10, 20, 30. Because it sounds like, like you said, the people benefit from it the most are the people who are moving 40 trips, 30 trips a month. Maybe that will be a good point of reference.

Tennessee Captioning
8367 Greenvale Drive, Nashville, TN 37221
tennesseecaptioning.com

ROUGH DRAFT

>>DAN FREUDBERG: We can look at it a couple different ways. The main unknown there is how many people will take advantage of it. What we can do is arrange and say if everybody took advantage of it, this is kind of a maximum exposure, which would basically be whatever 10% of the access revenue would be for that particular example. Yeah.

>>APRIL MEREDITH: How would this look with the fare card situation? When you're -- using it like a debit card.

>>DAN FREUDBERG: There's a couple of different options. But we can actually set up what would be called products that you could purchase and one of those products could be a ten ride pass or -- a ten ride packet.

>>APRIL MEREDITH: Oh, I like that.

>>DAN FREUDBERG: And that discount would be applied to that package and you get ten uses. And you can also have the pay as you go option where it just automatically deducts from an account of stored transit value.

>>APRIL MEREDITH: Sure. I like that. Thank you.

>>JAMES BROWN: All right. Mileage update for On Demand.

>>DAN FREUDBERG: So this is Dan again. We had a request to look at the OnDemand mileage breakdown in one-mile increments and look at how far people are traveling on the service. And the -- there was a spreadsheet that was sent out with that information, although it was saved to a tab -- saved to an incorrect tab. You had to click on a different tab on the spreadsheet to get to the information. So I understand if people haven't had a chance to review that. But I don't know if you want me to necessarily -- I've got the percentage of trips taken in one-mile increments all the way from one mile to 35 miles which was the longest trip that we had for the month of July. I also have it broken out into five-mile increments which might be a little easier just verbally for the committee to review here. So I can read that and if you have a specific question about a specific mileage range, we can talk about that.

But between 0 and 5 miles we had -- for July, 373 trips or about 9% of total trips were in that range. 5-10 miles was about 13 to 14% of trips. Between 10-15 miles, 19% of trips. 15-20, had the majority -- more than any other 5-mile bucket at 32%.

>>APRIL MEREDITH: Interesting.

>>DAN FREUDBERG: 20-25 miles was 16%. 25-30 was 10 1/2% and then 30-35 was just -- actually just 5 trips. And so we -- these are from July and of course the fare structure changed in August where the per mile trip distance went from 16 to 14 miles and the base fare went from 6 to \$7. So we could see these numbers change in

Tennessee Captioning
8367 Greenvale Drive, Nashville, TN 37221
tennesseecaptioning.com

ROUGH DRAFT

response to that. But it gives you an idea of the breakdown. So if you look at the total percentage of trips that are, for example, below 15 miles, it's about 41 -- about 42%. So is that -- if we can make sure to have that shared in a table version that's accessible for screen readers, is that the kind of information that the committee is looking for and that would be useful moving forward?

>>NATASHA WILKINS: Definitely, yeah. Definitely. Excel would probably be the best.

>> Excel would be the best way to do it.

>>NATASHA WILKINS: Yes, absolutely.

>>JAMES BROWN: All right. Any questions about that information? Or anything in particular that you were looking for? It was a total number of trips for July, too.

>>DAN FREUDBERG: The total number in July was about 4 -- almost 4,300 trips. Specifically for access On Demand.

>>JAMES BROWN: I'm anxious to see how those numbers go up and down, especially as the fares go up.

>>TOM HINKSON: Were these 4300 On Demand trips included in the 29,700 total trips mentioned earlier or is that separate?

>>DAN FREUDBERG: The 27,000 exclude though. 27 plus about 4300. So total number.

>>TOM HINKSON: 31,000 total.

>>DAN FREUDBERG: That's right.

>>APRIL MEREDITH: I'm sorry, I haven't had a chance to review the information. But how does it divide up amongst the different options like Mobility Solutions.

>>DAN FREUDBERG: I have the total number of trips by provider. What I don't have is the breakdown to show if these mileage ranges vary by provider. But Music City taxi did just under 500 On Demand mobility did 200. Taxi USA disabout 950 and you serve did about 770 out of those almost 4,300.

>>JAMES BROWN: Sounds like On Demand is doing about 40% of total trips.

>>NATASHA WILKINS: And Music City just got added on, too. I used them twice just to see how it goes and they did a good job. They might bump up a little bit more now that they're in the mix.

>>APRIL MEREDITH: Thank you, Dan.

Tennessee Captioning
8367 Greenvale Drive, Nashville, TN 37221
tennesseecaptioning.com

ROUGH DRAFT

>>DAN FREUDBERG: No problem.

>>JAMES BROWN: Any questions for Dan?

>>DAN FREUDBERG: Is the 5-mile bucket would you rather -- it seemed a little overwhelming when I started looking at 1-mile increments.

>>JAMES BROWN: Well, the person who made this motion is not here, so I tried to get a little clarification of, you know, exactly what he wanted to pinpoint from the motion and I couldn't get any of that clarification. I know Debbie -- I think Debbie wanted kind of these numbers to show how successful the program is being overall but I -- it's much more palatable for me and those 5-mile increments. Because when you start breaking it down mile by mile, I really can't compare the pieces very well.

>>DAN FREUDBERG: Right.

>>DAN FREUDBERG: Okay.

>>NATASHA WILKINS: Thanks for those statistics.

>>JAMES BROWN: Progress report. Is that you, Dan, as well?

>>DAN FREUDBERG: Yeah. Just a review of the access statistics. We already talked about the ridership actually with the trips. Just to let know you we are essentially flat compared to last year in terms of the core access program but we did see a large increase on the Access On Demand trips. 7,000 in July 2018 to almost 4,300 number. So overall a fairly significant increase in the total number of trips and that's something that we can continue to keep an eye on in terms of assessing the overall cost of the program and impact. But we also are interested to see what the effects of those fare changes are on those numbers. Even if those numbers stay relatively consistent, the fare increases on the access On Demand program and especially the mileage reduction makes it so that the cost to the agency is a little bit less because that cost is being shared greater terms percentage wise with the customer. We had a large increase -- sorry, we showed an encouraging trend in passengers carried per complaint. The numbers actual will you went down in-house but went up on the taxi service. This time last year we only had one taxi provider and they were struggling to meet the demand we were giving to them. Saw a big improvement from 157 carried per complaint to almost 300 on taxi and increase in on time performance from 89% to 94 1/2% on -- specifically on the taxi services for July. Obviously, you know, we've heard from some customers here and some committee members that trips are still not always on time and we do have issues that need to be addressed and again, happy to figure out exactly what happened with those specific issues and also make sure that we're following up in a time -- in a time sensitive fashion and a responsible fashion with

Tennessee Captioning
8367 Greenvale Drive, Nashville, TN 37221
tennesseecaptioning.com

ROUGH DRAFT

customers when they do submit those kind of complaints. So sound like we have a disconnect in the process that we need to dig into.

And then I think that covers -- we were pretty much flat in terms on on time performance for the van service. Not any big changes there. We do struggle -- we are struggling some with the construction on 440 cause ago lot of -- yeah.

>>APRIL MEREDITH: Everybody is.

>>DAN FREUDBERG: It's not so much 440 itself as the alternate routes that people are taking and it's slowing down service a bit. We continue to work with that and fortunately having those additional providers on board allows us to distribute those trips a little bit less -- I guess aggressively would be the word so that there's more time for those trips to be served in a timely fashion.

>>JAMES BROWN: Dan, are we seeing that the trips overall including On Demand and regular access are sort of a zero sum game so if OnDemand increases double from July to August, do we see that net decrease go down and regular access trips?

>>DAN FREUDBERG: So we were about flat for regular access, increase of about 100. Saw increase for this month specifically of you know a few thousand. for access On Demand which is higher than we've seen in previous month. But again, we'll see what that looks like in August and September with the new fare structure in place. Suspect it's going to be a little bit of a change there. And again, everything that we've looked at so far indicates that with those fare changes that were put into place that the program is -- with those increases that the program is largely sustainable revenue neutral. A lot of what we might be seeing at this point is also -- is just a general increase in demand on the service in response to --

>>JAMES BROWN: People going back to school type thing?

>>DAN FREUDBERG: Yeah, we're looking at apples to apples because we're looking at July compared to July for these numbers. But we also have people that may be returning to the service honestly because of the service quality challenges that we had previously with just the one provider and them being overloaded. Now that we're providing a little bit more reliable service, customers feel it's a little bit more reliable and take it a little bit more often and I think that's reflected in these numbers as well.

>>NATASHA WILKINS: What I'm going to be interested to see is since the fare change with these same-day service, if there was -- if there will be a back turn of numbers going down and running back to the AccessRide service. That's what I'm going to be interested to see. We've already determined that taking the AccessRide service for the company costs more versus the same-day trips because the customers are absorbing a little bit more of the cost. That's neither here or there but I'm interested to see if it stays flat and I think I'm hoping that it does. But if it stays that way. But it sounds like that's a

Tennessee Captioning
8367 Greenvale Drive, Nashville, TN 37221
tennesseecaptioning.com

ROUGH DRAFT

possibility. But we have a good starting point since you already have all these July numbers. So we have a really good starting point to see where it starts and where it end. Where the fare change starts.

>>DAN FREUDBERG: We're interested to see that as well.

>>NATASHA WILKINS: Everybody wants to.

>>APRIL MEREDITH: The -- yeah, I mean, I'll be honest, that's why I bought that package of tickets is because I'm still going to be using On Demand in the morning to get to work and during the day, you know, if I have some, you know, appointments that are -- makes me more efficient at work. But that last trip of the day, I can -- I can be a little slower on that one, so that's -- it's for that end of the day return that I'm planning to utilize those regular WeGo access. And I know I'm only one person, but I do know that my -- my shift back a little bit, you know, and not quite as balanced. And I also just wanted to say you were mentioning the fare changes. Thank you to the WeGo for putting out the survival guides. We've been handing out --

>>JAMES BROWN: That was so comical.

>>APRIL MEREDITH: I've been handing out quite a few to my consumers. So it's been very appreciated and I know quite a few people have shared -- consumers have shared with me that they have shifted back to utilizing the service instead of Lyft or Uber because of hearing oh, things are better.

>>NATASHA WILKINS: Okay.

>>APRIL MEREDITH: And you know, it is better for their pocketbook, of course, and their budget. But -- so there has been a shift to utilize that and getting them more access to the community again. They were doing without some. And now -- and because it was just too stressful, you know, waiting for an hour past your window, things like that. You're missing your appointments anyway. So it's the beginning of your movie, things like that. So now there are some people that have shared that they -- word is getting out there and they are starting to utilize it again.

>>DAN FREUDBERG: That's encouraging to hear. I appreciate that. And obviously -- and that's not to detract from obviously the real concerns that other customers have.

>>APRIL MEREDITH: Of course not.

>>DAN FREUDBERG: That we still have some improvements that need to be made but appreciate that. I think that also speaks to sometimes external factors that can influence some of these numbers here. So we kind of focus on what we're doing, but also, you know, the cost of transportation, for example, Uber, Lyft, have seen typical

Tennessee Captioning
8367 Greenvale Drive, Nashville, TN 37221
tennesseecaptioning.com

ROUGH DRAFT

fares that have been increasing and so people do respond to that as well in terms of what other options are available.

>>JAMES BROWN: All right. Sounds like everybody's done asking Dan questions. Thanks, Dan. We appreciate all you guys do.

>>DAN FREUDBERG: Thank you.

>>JAMES BROWN: Really do.

>> What is the survival guide? What is that?

(Laughter)

>>APRIL MEREDITH: Survival guide?

>>JAMES BROWN: That is MTA being a drama queen is what that is.

(Laughter)

>>APRIL MEREDITH: It made me laugh, too. But people are utilizing it.

>>JAMES BROWN: I'll let Dan tell you.

>>DAN FREUDBERG: The survival guide is put together by our marketing and communications department, Jason spent a lot of time to pull that information together from scheduling and it gives the highlights of pretty large set of schedule changes that are being made effective actually this coming Sunday, especially on the fixed route. Mainly on fixed route. There aren't actually any changes that are going into effect for paratransit at the same time, but there's just -- there's some information this there about the Access On Demand program.

>>SHEILA HANSEN: I have a quick question. Do you know when the new printed schedules are coming out?

>>DAN FREUDBERG: New printed schedules, I know they're online now. The printed schedules themselves are going to start being replaced this -- at the end of this week, Thursday and Friday, just to try to avoid confusion with replacing old schedules with new and people thinking those changes are already into effect. A few of them on the routes that have fewer changes aren't going to be available until the second week of changes. So I think October 5. But the vast majority of them will be -- will be ready and they're online.

>>SHEILA HANSEN: I'm mainly interested in getting a system map.

Tennessee Captioning
8367 Greenvale Drive, Nashville, TN 37221
tennesseecaptioning.com

ROUGH DRAFT

>>DAN FREUDBERG: Gotcha. I can check when the system maps are available. I think it's going to be a little later. But we also have some other electronic tools available, the transit app, for example, is updated with the new schedules and the new routes. If you plan a trip starting after the 29th you'll have access to that new information. You may just have to upgrade the app in order to --

>>SHEILA HANSEN: I have seen them on the app, they're already up. I already planned a trip for next week after it -- after it changes just to see if it worked and it did.

>>DAN FREUDBERG: Okay.

>> This is Roger. I have a question. You may not be the appropriate person to ask, but has WeGo ever thought about partnering with, say, Mid Cumberland Regional for rides outside the Davidson County area? They don't provide any in Davidson County. They're located here in Davidson County but they come to Davidson County on a daily basis. I don't know if y'all have ever talked to them or tried to do anything to help people that's going to doctors, lawyers, or something, you know, with them. That may be an option for y'all to look at. Y'all may not want to do that.

>>DAN FREUDBERG: Yeah, we've -- I'm aware of Mid-Cumberland Resources Agency. I'm not aware of any conversation we've had recently in terms of facilitate a go transfer or something like that. I know we have some customers that do receive transportation to somewhere around the county line and we transfer and take them the rest of the way. But I can find out more information on that and see what conversations we may have had, what opportunities there might be. Just for better coordination if nothing else.

>>JAMES BROWN: That's a great segue for me. Because there's something really big brewing at the state Capitol. Something huge that I think is going to be just sensational and I'm not going to -- I'm just going to tease you a little bit. I'm not going to tell you too much, but I will say that myself and another disability organization have drafted some legislation this week that Senator Becky Massey who is the transportation committee chair and also the champion for disabilities in the state Senate is floating to the commissioner of the Tennessee Department of Transportation and is also floating in the Republican caucus. It's going on in about two weeks as some legislation that she's going to be sponsoring this year as the chair. So it might take care of some of these regional transportation issues. I don't think this is going to happen overnight, but it eventually, when you look at the ten-year plan for disability and transportation in Tennessee, it could be really big. So that is taking place right now.

I might be attending tip at that in October. I put an a in there. It's Tennessee Public Transportation Association. Little brother to APTA, which is the American Public Transportation Association. If I'm able to attend that and get off work, I will report what's going on there. It can also be related to what's going on kind of behind us at the State

Tennessee Captioning
8367 Greenvale Drive, Nashville, TN 37221
tennesseecaptioning.com

ROUGH DRAFT

Capitol. So we'll see what happens there.

WeGo pilot grocery delivery service, we talked about this last meeting. Idea of Tom's. Very good idea. And it's something that I want the digital solutions committee to start working on as soon as possible. I think it's a super idea. So we're going to work through that. Airport update, Natasha, you want to hit that really quick?

>>NATASHA WILKINS: I've been diligently trying to reach out to the airport's ADA coordinator. She has not responded back. However, we will not be denied. So I will continue to reach out to her and I guess if I have to, Tanesha, I'll put on you, too, because I know you've already corresponded with her. I basically just sent her an email just really to email suggesting that we wanted to build a partnership as APAC with her office now that there are changes in where the airport pickup and drop-off is for WeGo AccessRide passengers. So that's kind of just to let you know how I worded it. We want to build a partnership hopefully with the opportunity to go out and in person work directly with the sky caps, if you want to use the word "train" the sky caps, the people directing us to and from so they will know. So as soon as I can get something back, I will definitely report on it. But I'm grateful to have this opportunity and Tanesha, I might have to pull on you.

>>TANESHA SIMMONS: That's okay. And I was actually at the airport earlier this month actually and so I said that I needed assistance to find the WeGo stop and MTA stop and they told me exactly where it was.

>>JAMES BROWN: There we go.

>>TANESHA SIMMONS: I don't know if I just got lucky and got the right person or if they're doing any training.

>>JAMES BROWN: Did you say AccessRide or WeGo?

>>TANESHA SIMMONS: I said can you Heche me get to the bus stop, the WeGo stop.

>>JAMES BROWN: They seem to know that one. If you say AccessRide I think they start going uh.

>>TANESHA SIMMONS: I said everything. I said all of them.

>>JAMES BROWN: You still planted WeGo in there.

>>TANESHA SIMMONS: I put it all in there.

>>JAMES BROWN: You showed your cards.

>>TANESHA SIMMONS: No, it's not about showing my card. It's about asking the question. I don't know how they refer to it because we are WeGo now. And everything

Tennessee Captioning
8367 Greenvale Drive, Nashville, TN 37221
tennesseecaptioning.com

ROUGH DRAFT

says signage says WeGo or access. So we had a name change. Where's the bus stop? Where's the AccessRide bus stop, the WeGo.

>>JAMES BROWN: We do thank you for that.

>>GEROME BOWEN: I have a quick question for you, James, before we adjourn.

>>JAMES BROWN: We'll go to Dan first.

>>DAN FREUDBERG: I know we're running a little over, I have to leave so I want to make sure I can get -- said I'm here.

>>JAMES BROWN: Sheila is going to be our secretary for the next handful of meetings until the next election. I want to thank her for that.

>>GEROME BOWEN: My question, James?

>>JAMES BROWN: So yes, thank you, Sheila. And we only have a handful of meetings left until elections which will be actually not too far when you look at it in the grand scheme of things. Are there any announcements? We've got just a few more minutes here. Any really cool things going on with any organizations that are a part of our committee?

>>NATASHA WILKINS: Are we meeting in November?

>>TANESHA SIMMONS: November 13.

>>JAMES BROWN: November 13 is our next meeting. That's a great question. Lorri, are you seeking the floor?

>>TANESHA SIMMONS: Lorri, were you seeking the floor?

>>JAMES BROWN: She'll type something if she is.

>>TANESHA SIMMONS: She's not typing.

>>APRIL MEREDITH: Empower Tennessee would be happy to be a part of the disability sensitivity training as we call it. That's the phrase we use. But yeah, awareness, education, all -- whatever word you want to use in regards to the airport transition. I will say that once I was at the southwest corner when I did my summer trip, I had no problem with getting assistance here but when I tried to return from Washington, DC, they flat out denied me assistance to get to my -- to the --

>> On what basis?

Tennessee Captioning
8367 Greenvale Drive, Nashville, TN 37221
tennesseecaptioning.com

ROUGH DRAFT

>>APRIL MEREDITH: Because I had somebody with me that had eyesight. It was my -- you know, my daughter, but I said well, I'm -- I'm her mother, I'm leading the way, you know. And I need some assistance, please. And she will --

>>JAMES BROWN: I don't know what the federal regulations are.

>>NATASHA WILKINS: Was this southwest?

>>APRIL MEREDITH: Uh-huh.

>>NATASHA WILKINS: That's strange because I just took a trip and I just got back from New York and I was traveling with family and we still had a sky cap there waiting.

>>APRIL MEREDITH: Neither place was anybody waiting for me, even though I had reserved it. And I was flagged for it. But yeah.

>>NATASHA WILKINS: That can be individual. Individually people can make up rules in their head as they go. But I can guarantee you I've never had that experience and I fly Southwest all the time and I just came back with family and there was someone waiting even though there was someone with me with sight. So I don't know what that is about. James and Tanesha, I did, when I came back, despite I had someone with me, I said I need help to the WeGo, I did say WeGo AccessRide. So Tanesha, I did the same thing Tanesha did and it was crickets. It was crickets. So I think it's individualized. You got to get that right person at the right time. But that's not, you know -- that's not sufficient enough. We want everybody to be educated. I think that education has to go both ways. We as the customers needs to know what's the right thing, what's the best way to articulate that, but also more importantly the airport authority needs to have 100% of their staff prepared and ready to go when I say WeGo AccessRide, AccessRide, WeGo, they know where to go. But we found it, but it was with no help of the sky cap. Yeah.

>> This is Robert. I was at a meeting with the airport authority people last --

>>JAMES BROWN: Roger speak loudly, get mad.

>> Okay. You got me now.

>>JAMES BROWN: Okay.

>> I was with the airport authority in a meeting last week with Tammy Warren and several others for Middle Tennessee Council for the Blind, and we discussed some of our issues and stuff that the vision impaired had. They told us where the WeGo stop was, that all the buses and access rides, city buses, the buses for the hotels are going to be basically permanent at that spot. They said that they had sky caps that came in the garage that would help you to get to that WeGo stop if you asked or the airlines was

Tennessee Captioning
8367 Greenvale Drive, Nashville, TN 37221
tennesseecaptioning.com

ROUGH DRAFT

supposed to have if you asked, you know. It could still be an issue but we did meet with them for about an hour, hour and a half last Wednesday, the relationship committee did with Middle Tennessee Council for the Blind.

>>JAMES BROWN: Gerome, are you still here?

>>TANESHA SIMMONS: He's about to walk back in in a couple of minutes.

>>JAMES BROWN: I hear his cane out there. I wanted to address one more thing and I want to wait for Gerome.

>>TOM HINKSON: John Forbes has a question.

>>JOHN FORBES: John Forbes speaking. I have a question for April. Was the lack of assistance at the Washington airport?

>>APRIL MEREDITH: Yes.

>>JOHN FORBES: Did you -- when you purchased your plane ticket did you have it marked assistance with a wheelchair?

>>APRIL MEREDITH: I had it marked as blind and requests sighted assistance. There was two markings.

>>JOHN FORBES: See, when I fly --

>>APRIL MEREDITH: I know sometimes they -- they will show up with a wheelchair because --

>>JAMES BROWN: And they'll push you down into it.

>>APRIL MEREDITH: In my case, and I know this is probably a little bit too much personal information, but if you care to listen, I've been diagnosed with arthritis in my knees so the DC airport's a little bit lengthy and yeah, so I would have been -- that was my first time going to that airport and I would have preferred to have had some -- someone to push me in a wheelchair. Here in Nashville on my way to my first flight going towards DC, the person was assisting someone else in a wheelchair and asked me to follow behind him.

>>NATASHA WILKINS: Oh, no.

>>APRIL MEREDITH: No, I was okay with that.

>>SHEILA HANSEN: I have done that, too.

Tennessee Captioning
8367 Greenvale Drive, Nashville, TN 37221
tennesseecaptioning.com

ROUGH DRAFT

>>APRIL MEREDITH: I was okay following but it should have been my choice, not telling me that I needed to do that. Yeah.

>>JAMES BROWN: Airport guy.

>>APRIL MEREDITH: So there -- you know. But, I mean, I actually had a little bit of a surprise -- argument in DC with the person.

>>NATASHA WILKINS: That's horrible.

>>APRIL MEREDITH: They heard from me officially, an official complaint to the airlines.

>>SHEILA HANSEN: You go, girl.

>>JOHN FORBES: John speaking. My travel agent advised me to start purchasing my tickets marked assistance with wheelchair. Ever since I started doing that, I have had no problem getting to the gate and catching my plane and being transferred like in Atlanta. If I did not have that marked on my return trip from Louisiana, I would have missed the plane. I had just 20 minutes when I got off the plane to catch the next one, last flight out back to Nashville. The assistance got me there in 18 minutes.

>>JAMES BROWN: They usually know where they're going, too, so that can help. So the last thing I wanted to address, I got most -- most of you received the email sent out a couple of months ago about the new digital solutions committee and that I would be chairing that committee. Now, I got an email later on from Debbie, and she was under the understanding that if you were the chair of APAC that you were ex officio member of all the committees, subcommittees, therefore you couldn't be a committee chair. Well, you know, I've been involved with nonprofit work for about nine years. I'm like I've never heard that ex officio member means that you cannot be the chair of a committee. As a matter of fact, I've heard the opposite of that. And so I emailed her back and said can you show me that in the bylaws or show me some sort of documentation if that's correct, because immaterial to know. I haven't heard back from her yet, but I did go ahead and research, you know, the question in my handy dandy "Robert's Rules of Order" handbook and so after, you know, researching a little bit, I found out that there are a lot of nonprofits who pay their committee chairs and so if you're the head of a committee and you're ex officio member of a bunch of subcommittees and those are paid positions and you appoint yourself as the chair of all these other commissions that there's a conflict of interest. You're essentially kind of paying yourself to do this. And so -- but in cases where we're just volunteering like we do, I'm going to double April's salary after we leave here because zero times zero is nothing. So -- but we don't do that. So there is no conflict of interest. And so if you would like to, "Robert's Rules of Order" said if there is a conflict of interest and you would like your committee chair who is an ex-fish owe member to not be able to name himself or herself as chair, then you have to put that in the bylaws.

Tennessee Captioning
8367 Greenvale Drive, Nashville, TN 37221
tennesseecaptioning.com

ROUGH DRAFT

>>GEROME BOWEN: Let me ask you a question.

>>JAMES BROWN: It's not in our bylaws.

>>GEROME BOWEN: Let me ask you a question. I read some stuff to you a little while ago. The question to me is you asked me to establish the technology committee. What is the reason you want to chair this committee? I know for a fact that --

>>JAMES BROWN: I didn't ask you to establish a technology question.

>>GEROME BOWEN: You asked me to find a technology person. I don't want to argue about it.

>>JAMES BROWN: I'm sorry, but I think there's a misunderstanding.

>>GEROME BOWEN: Let me finish talking.

>>JAMES BROWN: Don't get mad.

>>GEROME BOWEN: I'm getting sick of you doing it all day. Let's get this straight. You asked me to bring forth arrest person for technology and I did that. I want to know your reason why you don't feel like you like this person.

>>JAMES BROWN: Why I'm not appointing Patrick as the chair.

>>GEROME BOWEN: I want to know that.

>>JAMES BROWN: This is probably not the place for this.

>>GEROME BOWEN: When you find the place you call me.

>>JAMES BROWN: Gerome, do you remember telling me that you didn't want this committee to be one that argued? That when we brought new members in we --

>>GEROME BOWEN: Disrespectful all day and I went along with it. I'm --

>>APRIL MEREDITH: This is being captioned. One person at a time.

>>GEROME BOWEN: I asked the question. You all have a great day and you talk about this by yourself.

>>JAMES BROWN: The short answer is, me and Patrick have --

>>GEROME BOWEN: James, we're not going to talk about it. You cut me off so I'm through with it. Have a great day. No.

Tennessee Captioning
8367 Greenvale Drive, Nashville, TN 37221
tennesseecaptioning.com

ROUGH DRAFT

>>JAMES BROWN: Because we've had trouble communicating, Gerome. And that's what we're having trouble right now. So I apologize for that.

Sorry for the meeting to end that way. And so Gerome earlier also told me today that there was an ex officio member and I couldn't be the chair as well. But I think I've sort of communicated the difference between, you know, how some bylaws state that there's not to be, you know, the committee chair who's supposed to translate and appoint himself as chair. But I'm not making any money here. But yeah, I do apologize for that.

>>APRIL MEREDITH: So I would assume that anybody could suggest to the bylaws committee if they wanted something like that added, is that correct?

>>JAMES BROWN: Yes, anybody can suggest that.

>>APRIL MEREDITH: I just wanted to throw that out there. But I wanted to clarify. So if somebody wants to add some sort of addendum or change about who -- about an ex officio unpaid chair of the APAC committee being allowed or maybe even being allowed to, maybe it should be explicitly stated so that future --

>>JAMES BROWN: It is explicitly stated.

>>APRIL MEREDITH: Okay. I'm trying. I'm trying, James. I'm just saying if there's any -- all of us are responsible for studying those. And bringing that working knowledge to these committee meetings and any communications in between. So --

>>JAMES BROWN: The big problem with nonprofit work is you have different types of nonprofit. So Debbie has been a part of nonprofits that pay quite a bit of money to the CEO and there's a big national organization that she's a part of that actually pay, so those conflicts of interest are there. And so when she's read past bylaws that's been instilled into her. And so it's easy for us to translate that over into other places and then tell other people that and then it causes big fights and things like that. But I want to thank everybody for coming. I think --

>>TANESHA SIMMONS: James, I have a question also. This is Tanesha Simmons. To my understanding at our last meeting that I know everybody wasn't here at our last meeting that you had, based off of our conversations, it was assumed that you had appointed Patrick to the chair and then we received an email that you were going to be the chair. So I -- there was a level of confusion for me on what -- so I was confused about that. And I think that's where that energy is coming from. What changed and what happened and what was discussed?

>>JAMES BROWN: Well see, nothing changed. So --

>>APRIL MEREDITH: This is April, I believe it was in the minutes.

Tennessee Captioning
8367 Greenvale Drive, Nashville, TN 37221
tennesseecaptioning.com

ROUGH DRAFT

>>JAMES BROWN: It was in the minutes.

>>APRIL MEREDITH: That Patrick was appointed.

>>JAMES BROWN: I'll tell you exactly what's in the minutes. Patrick asked me three times are you going to appoint me as chair. I resisted the first time. He said the second time, are you going to appoint me as chair. I resisted. He asked me the third time and I said yes, Patrick I was going to appointment as chair. Not I am appointing you as chair. I was going to appoint you. Because --

>>TANESHA SIMMONS: But you also said persistence pace off.

>>JAMES BROWN: That's my sarcasm.

>>TANESHA SIMMONS: But sarcasm --

>>JAMES BROWN: If you remember there was a committee appointment before that. I was appointing Patrick as committee chair of the accessibility committee. He had agreed to do that in person to me. And then when we got to the committee, he said everybody, I'm not doing this but I have this other motion about this other committee that I want to be chair of and I'm going to -- and we're going to kind of do it this way. So that's where things --

>>TANESHA SIMMONS: Which is the DSOC which is what you decided you're now going to chair.

>>JAMES BROWN: Yeah.

>>TANESHA SIMMONS: That's what he presented.

>>NATASHA WILKINS: I guess we want to make sure we as a committee understand, we want to make sure we got the reasoning in behind, you know --

>>JAMES BROWN: The reasoning is because me and Patrick have continued to have these communication issues. So not just with this issue but with another issue that recently came up where Patrick said he was going to -- he was going to write out a proposal, he agreed to do this before the committee, and when I was trying to communicate was, you know, was he doing this, was he in the process. I got a bunch of lawyer speak. And so I couldn't get a straight answer out of him, and so I just decided, you know, that this is going to be an important committee, I'm going to go ahead and take the reins and I was going to ask Patrick to co-chair the committee. I still have that in mind, I don't know if he's going to accept it because I know he really wanted to chair the committee. And so that's where we are. That's the honest -- my sharing with you.

Tennessee Captioning
8367 Greenvale Drive, Nashville, TN 37221
tennesseecaptioning.com

ROUGH DRAFT

>>APRIL MEREDITH: Is anybody in charge -- chairing the Access Committee?

>>JAMES BROWN: Maybe. Maybe.

>>TANESHA SIMMONS: I don't think so.

>>JAMES BROWN: Let's see.

>>APRIL MEREDITH: I hope I didn't start a problem. I'm sorry.

>>JAMES BROWN: So we are adjourning because if we don't, we're going to be charged a little extra for our CART. So meeting adjourned. We can continue this offline if you guys want to. Thank you for coming.

This text is being provided in a rough draft format. CART captioning, Communication Access Realtime Translation captioning, is provided in order to facilitate communication accessibility and may not be a totally verbatim record of the proceedings. Any video that has been reproduced in text format is to comply with the Americans with Disabilities Act under the Fair Use Doctrine. This file is not to be distributed or used in any way that may violate copyright law.

Tennessee Captioning
8367 Greenvale Drive, Nashville, TN 37221
tennesseecaptioning.com

ROUGH DRAFT